Faculty of Science and Engineering

School of Geography, Earth and Environmental Sciences

2023-03

Agricultural systems regulate plant and insect (beetle) diversity and induce ecosystem novelty

Woodbridge, J

http://hdl.handle.net/10026.1/20250

10.1016/j.ancene.2023.100369 Anthropocene Elsevier

All content in PEARL is protected by copyright law. Author manuscripts are made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the details provided on the item record or document. In the absence of an open licence (e.g. Creative Commons), permissions for further reuse of content should be sought from the publisher or author.

Agricultural systems regulate plant and insect (beetle) diversity and induce ecosystem novelty

- 3
- 4 *Jessie Woodbridge^a, Ralph Fyfe^a, David Smith^b, Anne de Varielles^c, Ruth Pelling^c, Michael
- 5 J Grant^d, Robert Batchelor^e, Robert Scaife^f, James Greig^g, Petra Dark^e, Denise Druce^h, Geoff
- 6 Garbettⁱ, Adrian Parker^j, Tom Hill^{k,l}, J. Edward Schofield^m, Mike Simmondsⁿ, Frank
- 7 Chambers^o, Catherine Barnett^{e,p}, Martyn Waller^q
- 8
- 9 Author affiliations:
- 10
- ^aSchool of Geography, Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Plymouth, Drake
- 12 Circus, Plymouth, PL48AA, UK
- ¹³ ^bDepartment of Classics, Ancient History & Archaeology, University of Birmingham,
- 14 Edgbaston, Birmingham, B152TT, UK
- ^cHistoric England, Fort Cumberland, Fort Cumberland Road, Portsmouth, P049LD, UK
- 16 ^dCoastal and Offshore Archaeological Research Services, Ocean and Earth Science, National
- 17 Oceanography Centre Southampton, European Way, Southampton, SO143ZH, UK
- ^eDepartment of Archaeology, University of Reading, Whiteknights, Reading RG66AB, UK
- 19 ^fGeography and Environmental Science, University of Southampton, University Road,
- 20 Southampton, SO171BJ, UK
- 21 ^gSouthwold Avenue, King's Norton, Birmingham, B303RJ, UK
- 22 ^hOxford Archaeology North, Mill 3, Moor Lane Mills, Moor Lane, Lancaster, LA11QD, UK
- ⁱSchool of Social Sciences, Oxford Brookes University, Headington, Oxford OX13TB
- ^jSchool of Environment, Earth and Ecosystem Sciences, Open University, Walton Hall,
- 25 Milton Keynes, MK76AA, UK
- 26 ^kOceanography Centre Southampton, European Way, Southampton, SO143ZH, UK
- ²⁷ ¹The Natural History Museum, Cromwell Road, South Kensington, London, UK, SW7 5BD
- ²⁸ ^mDepartment of Geography & Environment, School of Geosciences, University of Aberdeen,
- 29 AB24 3UF, UK
- 30 ⁿQuaternary Scientific (QUEST), School of Archaeology, Geography and Environmental
- 31 Science, University of Reading, Whiteknights, Reading, Berkshire, UK
- 32 °Centre for Environmental Change and Quaternary Research, School of Natural and Social
- 33 Sciences, University of Gloucestershire, Francis Close Hall, Swindon Rd, Cheltenham,
- 34 GL504AZ, UK
- ⁹Stantec UK Caversham Bridge House, Waterman Place, Reading RG18DN, UK
- ^qDepartment of Geography and Geology, Kingston University London, Penrhyn Road,
- 37 Kingston upon Thames, Surrey, KT12EE, UK
- 38
- 39 *Corresponding author: Jessie Woodbridge, School of Geography, Earth and Environmental
- 40 Sciences, University of Plymouth, UK, <u>jessie.woodbridge@plymouth.ac.uk</u>
- 41
- 42
- 43

44	Highlights
45	
46	• Integrating past environmental archives informs about land use and diversity change
47	• Insect and pollen diversity trends reflect disturbance caused by land-use change
48	• Ecosystem novelty is represented by non-analogue pollen species assemblages
49	 Novel ecosystems emerged from the cumulative long-term impacts of land-use
50	change
51	
52	
53	Abstract
54	
55	Land-use change plays an important role in shaping plant and insect diversity over long time
56	timescales. Great Britain provides an ideal case study to investigate patterns of long-term
57	vegetation and insect diversity change owing to the existence of spatially and temporally
58	extensive environmental archives (lake sediments, peatlands, and archaeological sites) and a
59	long history of landscape transformation through agrarian change. The trends identified in
6U 61	diversity trends to be investigated alongside exploration of the emergence of ecological
62	novelty. Using fossil pollen insect (beetle), archaeodemographic, archaeobotanical and
63	modern landscape datasets covering Britain similarities are identified between insect
64	diversity and pollen sample evenness indicating that vegetation beterogeneity influences
65	insect diversity. Changing land use captured by archaeobotanical data is significantly
66	correlated with pollen diversity demonstrating the role of human activity in shaping past
67	diversity trends with shifts towards ecosystem novelty identified in the form of non-analogue
68	pollen taxa assemblages (unique species combinations). Modern landscapes with higher
69	agricultural suitability are less likely to have pollen analogues beyond the last 1000 years,
70	whilst those in areas less suited to agriculture and on more variable topography are more
71	likely to have analogues older than 1000 years. This signifies the role of agriculture in the
72	creation of novel ecosystems. Ecological assemblages characteristic of earlier periods of the
73	Holocene may persist in areas less impacted by agriculture. The last 200 years has witnessed
74	major shifts in novelty in a low number of pollen sites suggesting that novel ecosystems
75	emerged over a longer time period resulting from the cumulative impacts of land-use change.
76	
77	Key words: biodiversity, disturbance, beetles, insects, pollen, land-use, paleoecology
78	
79	
80	1. Introduction
81	
82	1.1 Long-term records of diversity change
83	
84	Biodiversity loss has become of increasing international concern in recent decades with
85	numerous initiatives and targets set with the aim to enhance and protect biodiversity and
86	ecosystem resilience (European Commission, 2021). However, many targets that aim to

87 protect and restore biodiversity have not been reached globally (Nature, 2020). Much

- 88 conservation decision making is based on recent understanding only, and restoration studies
- often only look at single years or aim to maintain existing patterns (Wilson, 2021).
- 90 Agricultural systems have played a key role in biodiversity change in past (Birks et al.,
- 2016a) and modern systems (Dudley & Alexander, 2017; Outhwaite et al., 2022). Long-term
- 92 (paleo) environmental records provide insights into the multi-millennial scale patterns and
- 93 processes that lead to diversity change (Hjelle et al., 2012), for example, fossil pollen datasets
- 94 can be used as a proxy for land cover and vegetation diversity change, and fossil insect
- 95 (beetle) records reflect disturbances and human activity. Archaeological records of land use
- 96 (archaeobotany) and population change (archaeodemography) allow exploration of factors
 97 that influence these trends. Such datasets can be analysed alongside modern landscape data
- that influence these trends. Such datasets can be analysed alongside modern landscape dataallowing long-term patterns to be viewed within the context of contemporary agricultural
- 99 suitability.
- 100

The role of historic environmental change in shaping current diversity patterns has been 101 demonstrated (Gaston, 2000; Birks et al., 2016a; 2016b) with a focus on placing trends 102 identified in recent decades-centuries into the context of the longer-term past. Temperate 103 104 European vegetation trends have previously been described as characterised by declining biodiversity during initial forest development in the early Holocene (11700-8000 cal. BP) 105 (cal. BP: calibrated years Before Present, where present = AD 1950), stable levels of 106 diversity during periods dominated by closed mixed forest in the mid-Holocene (8000-6000 107 cal. BP), increasing biodiversity on fertile soils with the emergence of agricultural land use 108 from 6000-4000 cal. BP, and declining biodiversity in the most recent 200 years (Birks et al., 109 2016a). Subsequent research has identified similar trends for pollen sites across Britain 110 within the context of regional variability and has revealed that a recent decline in biodiversity 111 is not always detectable in fossil pollen datasets (Woodbridge et al., 2021). Novel plant 112 communities represent new combinations of taxa with no previous analogue and result from 113 the arrival or introduction of new species often representing human-driven changes, such as 114 altered land use, or climate change, and may be reflected by increasing 'Rate of Change' in 115 assemblage composition (Finsinger et al., 2017). 116

117

Spatial and temporal patterns of changing diversity derived from fossil pollen datasets have 118 been used to infer past biodiversity trends for various regions from temperate and northern 119 Europe to the Neotropics (Odgaard, 1994; Weng et al., 2006; Colombaroli et al., 2013; Felde 120 et al., 2016; Matthias et al., 2015; Reitalu et al., 2015; 2019; Kuneš et al., 2019; Roleček et 121 al., 2021). Similar challenges in elucidating the relationships between pollen diversity and 122 vegetation diversity have been described (Weng et al., 2007; Gosling et al., 2009) due to the 123 impacts of differential pollen dispersal and productivity, the effects of landscape openness 124 and changing pollen concentration on taxa representation in datasets, and the coarser 125 taxonomic resolution of fossil pollen data compared to plant taxonomy (Odgaard et al., 1999; 126 Weng et al., 2006; van der Knaap, 2009; Goring et al., 2013; Pardoe, 2021). Despite these 127 challenges, new methodological developments and suitable analytical approaches are 128 improving understanding of biodiversity change based on fossil pollen data (Roleček et al., 129 130 2021). Previous research has paved the way for palynology to go beyond describing patterns

- 131 of diversity change and, as a discipline, to play a key role in understanding the processes of
- 132 change and the relationships between ecosystem characteristics, disturbances, and diversity
- 133 change. The results of recent palynological studies demonstrate that pollen richness, which
- reflects the number of taxa, shows good correspondence with plant richness, as well as
- demonstrating that plant and pollen diversity are significantly related (Meltsov et al., 2011;
- 136Felde et al., 2016; Giesecke et al., 2014; 2019; Reitalu et al., 2019; Roleček et al., 2021).
- 137

Fossil insect datasets are used to investigate the impacts of changing land use or vegetation 138 cover and are informative about the spread and intensity of human settlement (Kenward, 139 1997; Smith, 2012; Smith et al., 2010, 2019, 2020). In a recent analysis of fossil insect 140 datasets from across Europe, Pilotto et al. (2022) suggest that the expansion of agriculture 141 6,000 years ago had as dramatic an impact on insect communities as rising temperatures in 142 the early Holocene. Smith et al. (2020) describe the increased scale of agriculture during the 143 late Bronze Age / early Iron Age (3100-2700 cal. BP; 1150-750 cal. BC) of the British Isles 144 as having a similar drastic effect on insect faunas. Insects include many different groups with 145 dissimilar responses to environmental changes. Within this research the Coleoptera (beetle) 146 147 insect group is analysed, and datasets are referred to as "insect" records. Exploration of 148 changing insect diversity in response to land-use and land-cover change in the past currently represents a knowledge gap in paleoenvironmental research. 149

150

151 *1.2 Diversity-disturbance relationships and ecological novelty*

152

The frequency and type of disturbances in a landscape influence plant and insect 153 communities on local to broad regional scales. Disturbance may include climatic change or 154 altered land-use practices, with differing consequences related to other landscape 155 characteristics, such as elevation and topography. Fossil pollen datasets have been used to 156 identify 'baseline' states, i.e. conditions that predate human disturbance and represent an 157 ecosystem's 'normal' range of variability (Willis et al., 2010; Forbes et al., 2018). The term 158 'ecological novelty' can be associated with human disturbances (Finsinger et al., 2017) or 159 climatic factors and represents change across different ecological levels from ecosystems to 160 landscapes. When the species represented within a sample and their abundances are uniquely 161 dissimilar to other samples within the same record and those from different sites (i.e. 'non-162 analogue' assemblages) this can be an indicator of 'ecological novelty'. From the onset of 163 Neolithic farming, significant landscape alterations have been well documented across 164 various global regions (Fyfe et al., 2015; Roberts et al., 2018; Woodbridge et al., 2019), 165 particularly associated with changing land-use practices and the spatiotemporal migration of 166 human populations (Racimo et al., 2020). Applying analytical techniques to pollen and insect 167 datasets, as a proxy for past vegetation and landscape change, allows assessment of 168 relationships between diversity and disturbance, which can be used to signify ecological 169 shifts and the emergence of novel ecosystems (Burke et al., 2019). 170

171

172 *1.3 Past land-use, population shifts, and climate change*

173

- 174 Archaeobotanical records (plant remains preserved at archaeological sites) provide a wealth
- of information about past subsistence and land-use strategies (de Vareilles et al., 2021). The
- 176 main factors that affect the recovery of archaeobotanical evidence are preservation
- 177 conditions, variations in sampling practices, and the nature and scale of past arable
- agriculture (van der Veen et al., 2007; Fuller and Stevens, 2012; van der Veen, 2014; Bishop,
- 179 2015; Carruthers and Hunter Dowse, 2019). Changes in crops, intensity and scale of
- 180 production, arable equipment, catchment and population size and structure, will have
- 181 profoundly altered the character of arable landscapes. Increased scale of arable production is
- indicated in archaeobotanical records by higher densities of bulk finds of charred plant
- remains (van der Veen, 2014) as well as features and structures associated with crop storageand processing. Significant arable innovations from the introduction of farming at the start of
- the Neolithic (~4000 BC) (~6000 cal. BP) to the Agricultural Revolution of the 18^{th} century
- AD are shown in Table 1. Knowledge of past land-use strategies, including the intensity (i.e.
- 187 input, such as labour or manure, per unit of soil) and extent of agriculture, allows
- understanding of how these processes influence plant and insect diversity and the role of
- 189 people in shaping biodiversity trends over historic timescales.
- 190
- 191 Archaeological datasets are also used to infer demographic change (Bevan et al., 2017) based
- 192 on the assumption that the density of radiocarbon-dated sites relates to human population size
- 193 (Shennan et al., 2013). Demographic trends may influence land requirements to support
- 194 changing populations and thus affect landscape change. The impacts of land-use changes are
- also constrained by the climatic tolerances and optima of plant and insect species.
- 196 Paleoclimate datasets reflecting North Atlantic climatic conditions are summarised in
- 197 Woodbridge et al. (2021) where significant relationships were identified between
- 198 palaeoclimate datasets, population change and pollen diversity trends.
- 199

Table 1 Summary of key agricultural developments in Britain affecting changes in scale and
 intensity of land-use. *follows Historic England's Period List, FISH terminology (Historic
 England, 2022).

Archaeological period*	Key agricultural events	Key references
Early Neolithic 4000 - 3300 BC (5950 - 5250 BP)	Advent and spread of farming across Britain	Brown (2007); Whittle et al. (2011)
Middle and Late Neolithic 3300 - 2200 BC	Decline in arable agriculture in some areas; shift to predominantly barley cultivation in Scotland/N England	Bishop (2015); Stevens & Fuller (2012; 2015)
Late Early to Middle Bronze Age 1800 - 1200 BC	Co-axial field/reave system; introduction of spelt wheat and pulses; start of the widespread use of the horse; increased scale of and diversity in cultivation	Bradley (2007); Historic England (2018); Marshall et al. (2019); Martin et al. (2012); Treasure and Church (2017)
Late Iron Age to Roman 100 BC to 400 AD	Coulter plough and the cultivation of heavy clay soils; cattle traction (possibly used earlier – Serjeantson 2012); increased scale of cultivation; horticulture developed; hay meadows	Allen et al. (2017); Boothe et al. (2007); Witcher (2013); Van der Veen (2014); Lodwick (2017); Robinson (2011)

Early medieval AD 410 - 1066	Limited evidence for the mouldboard plough from the (7 th)9 th – 11 th century, affecting soil hydrology and field ecology; Open field systems; cultivation becomes more extensive; free-threshing wheat and rye widely cultivated. Temporary land abandonment in the immediate post-Roman period in some areas.	Hamerow et al. (2020); McKerracher (2018); Stevens and Fuller (2018); Dark (2000)
Medieval AD 1066 - 1540	Black Death (AD 1346-1352): 40-60% mortality – significant reduction in agricultural labour and abandonment of arable land/villages	Benedictow (2004)
From AD 1700	Industrial Revolution, mechanised farming and the use of pesticides; improved cereals	

204

205

206

1.4 Investigating patterns of diversity and ecological novelty

This study presents the most extensive integrative research combining fossil pollen and insect 207 (beetle) records of diversity change from sites across Britain, and for the first time couples 208

these with long term land-use patterns inferred from plant macrofossil (archaeobotanical) 209

210 data. Records from a spatially extensive database spanning the last ~11,000 years are

integrated to identify and evaluate the relationships between land-use and plant and insect 211

diversity in addressing the following questions: 212

213

a) How does disturbance from land use affect diversity and do pollen and insect diversity 214 trends show the same patterns of change through time? 215

- b) To what extent can ecological novelty be identified in long-term ecological datasets and 216 when do novel ecosystems emerge? 217
- 218

220

219 2. Methods

221 2.1 Data assimilation and harmonisation

222

223 297 radiocarbon-dated fossil pollen datasets have been amalgamated from across Britain (Fig. 1 and Supplementary Information 1). BPOL database (an extensive archive of British fossil 224 pollen site information) (Grant et al., 2017) was used to identify datasets and provided 225 information about radiocarbon-dating quality. The pollen datasets partly derive from the 226 European Pollen Database (Leydet et al., 2007-2023) and were gathered within the 227 LandClimI project (Fyfe et al., 2013; Trondman et al., 2015). Additional datasets were 228 provided by data contributors and a small number of datasets have been digitised using 229 Straditize software (Sommer, 2019). Pollen records from individual coring sites have been 230 taxonomically harmonised using the European Pollen Database nomenclature (Leydet et al., 231 232 2007-2023) and summed into 200-year time windows for analysis. Total land pollen counts for each taxon were summed and percentages calculated as a proportion of the pollen grain 233

count for the time window. The approach follows Fyfe et al. (2015), Roberts et al. (2018) and 234

- Woodbridge et al. (2019). For digitised datasets, pollen percentages were averaged for each 235
- time window. Datasets with at least three radiocarbon dates were selected and chronologies 236
- have been constructed using "clam" (Blaauw, 2010) and "rbacon" (Blaauw, 2021) R 237
- packages. Information about the ¹⁴C dates that underpin the chronologies of the pollen 238
- records, and for ¹⁴C dates used in the construction of archaeodemographic data, is available 239
- 240 from the repository where the original data are archived (Leydet et al., 2007-2023; Bevan et al. 2017). All ¹⁴C dates were calibrated using the same parameters with the 'clam' or 'rbacon' 241
- R packages using the IntCal13 calibration curve (Reimer et al., 2016). Pollen datasets not 242
- derived from archaeological sites (e.g. those from lakes and peatland bogs) were used in the 243
- analyses to explore vegetation responses to land-use change. 244
- 245

The pollen datasets have been transformed into quantified land cover using the REVEALS 246

- (Regional Estimates of Vegetation Abundance from Large Sites) approach (Sugita, 2007; 247
- Fyfe et al., 2013; Marguer et al., 2014). Selection criteria were applied to identify pollen sites 248
- suitable for the REVEALS approach based on the model types currently available (Fig. 1c 249
- and Supplementary Information 1). The approach uses information about the relative pollen 250
- 251 productivity (RPPs) of different plants, the dispersal behaviour (fall speed) of different pollen
- types, and the site type (lake or peatland/bog) and size, to produce estimates of quantified 252
- vegetation cover. RPPs are only available for a sub-set of 23 pollen types (Abies alba, Alnus 253 glutinosa, Chenopodiaceae, Artemisia, Betula, Calluna vulgaris, Carpinus betulus, Cerealia-254
- type, Corylus avellana, Ericaceae, Fagus sylvatica, Filipendula, Fraxinus, Picea, Pinus, 255
- Plantago lanceolata type, Poaceae, deciduous Quercus, Rumex acetosa-type, Salix, Secale, 256
- *Tilia* and *Ulmus*) within these datasets, therefore quantified vegetation cannot be 257
- reconstructed for the entire land pollen assemblage. For this reason, we primarily calculate 258
- diversity from pollen percentage data for all land pollen types. The assumptions of the 259
- REVEALS model means that it can only be applied to groups of small or medium sized bogs 260
- and lakes (Githumbi et al., 2022), therefore REVEALS has not been applied to all sites 261
- (Supplementary Information 1). The REVEALS model produces estimates of regional 262 vegetation, which requires pollen sites to be grouped according to site type and size, 263
- geographical proximity to other sites, and landscape characteristics. This resulted in 37 sub-264
- regions illustrated in Fig. 1c. See Githumbi et al., (2022) for a detailed description of the 265 **REVEALS** approach. 266

267 572 fossil insect (beetle) assemblages from 117 different sites (Fig. 1) extending back to the 268 Late Glacial period (10,050 BC) (~12,000 cal. BP) have been combined. This includes data

- 269 from the BugsCEP database (Buckland & Buckland, 2006) and datasets amalgamated by 270
- Smith et al. (2010, 2019, 2020). Many of these datasets derive from archaeological sites, so 271
- species assemblages may reflect fauna around domestic dwellings or human-made structures. 272
- The datasets have been taxonomically harmonised, aggregated by archaeological period and 273
- converted to percentages. Insect data are dated by archaeological period according to the site 274
- context and the taxon harmonisation process followed the BugsCEP database taxonomy. The 275
- pollen sites have a largely uniform distribution across Britain with gaps in the midlands, 276
- while the insect datasets are largely located in the south and midlands. An 277
- 278 archaeodemographic dataset (Bevan et al., 2017) based on the summed probability

distributions (SPD) of radiocarbon-dated archaeological sites from across Britain is used as a
record of population change. Pollen samples from each 200-year time window were assigned
a corresponding archaeological period to match the phases assigned to each archaeobotanical
and insect sample according to site context to allow comparison between datasets.

- 283
- 284





Figure 1. Site locations: a) fossil insect (blue pentagons) and pollen (red circles) datasets
covering the Holocene (grey circles represent areas for regional analyses), b)

archaeobotanical sites (purple triangles), radiocarbon-dated archaeological sites (grey

- squares) (archaeodemography), and c) pollen sites used in the REVEALS model colour
- coded by site aggregation for regional vegetation reconstruction.
- 292

293 Modern landscape data have been extracted from within a 10 km radius around pollen sites 294 that have a sample in the most recent time window (AD 1750 - present) (200 to -70 cal. BP). 295 The 10 km distance was selected following previous work comparing modern pollen with remote sensed vegetation maps (Woodbridge et al., 2014b), to reflect the average pollen 296 297 source area of sites, and to capture both local and regional landscape characteristics. Topographic data were obtained from a 1 km resolution dataset using an elevation model for 298 the UK. Agricultural suitability derives from a 100 m resolution dataset obtained from the 299 Macaulay Land Use Research Institute (1991) for which data across England, Scotland and 300 Wales were combined. Agricultural suitability values represent the percentage of land area 301 within 10 km of a pollen site in agricultural suitability classes 1-3 (i.e. land capable of 302 producing 1: a very wide range of crops, 2: a wide range of crops, and 3: a moderate range of 303 crops). The relationship between pollen sample analogues and modern landscape data 304 (topographic roughness, elevation and agricultural suitability) is presented in a ternary plot 305 using the Ternary R package (Smith, 2017), which graphically presents the ratios between 306 three variables as positions within a triangle. Each pollen sample is plotted according to the 307 modern landscape characteristics at the coring site and colour coded by analogue matching. 308 Only sites that have pollen samples in the most recent time window (200 BP - present) were 309 included in the analogue matching exercise for comparison with all 297 pollen sequences. 310 311

Plant macrofossil data have been amalgamated from 1718 archaeobotanical samples (charred 312 plant macrofossil remains) from 110 sites across the southeast of England (Fig. 1). The 313 archaeobotanical data were analysed using cluster analysis and an autoecological approach 314 based on modern field observations of individual taxa tolerances to environmental conditions 315 (de Vareilles et al., in review). These datasets have been used to explore changes in the 316 composition and amount of crops and gathered resources to infer land-use scale and range of 317 plant foods (de Vareilles et al., 2021; in review). The bulk density of plant macrofossil 318 remains associated with different types of human land use (crop and cereal cultivation and 319 320 gathering resources) have been combined and are compared with pollen diversity scores. The 'cereal' macrofossil category includes barley (Hordeum vulgare), emmer wheat (Triticum 321 dicoccum), spelt wheat (T. spelta), free-threshing wheat (T. aestivum/durum/turgidum), rye 322 (Secale cereale) and oat (Avena sativa). The 'gathered' category includes hazelnut (Corylus 323 avellana), prunus (Prunus spp.), apple/pear (Malus/Pyrus sp.), elder (Sambucus nigra), 324 berries (Rubus spp. and Fragaria vesca), hawthorn (Crataegus monogyna) and acorn 325 (Quercus sp.). However, interpretations based on these taxa groups must take into account 326 that fruits and nuts are likely to have been cultivated by the Roman period, and oats are likely 327 328 to have been wild until the late Iron Age. Figure 3a is based on these studies and shows a conceptual summary of the changes in land use 'scale' (i.e. production relative to population) 329 and range (i.e. the range of cultivated crops), which includes 0: pre-agriculture, 1: pastoral 330 with limited arable production, 2: subsistence farming, 3: broader spectrum subsistence 331 farming, 4: surplus production with further diversification of crops, 5: further increase in the 332 333 crop spectrum and scale of production, and 6: change and increase in the crop spectrum and

- continued growth of production. Palaeodemographic changes are estimated based on the
- summed probability distribution (SPD) of 22,719 archaeological radiocarbon (14 C) dates for
- Britain (Bevan et al., 2017). The package 'rearbon' was used to produce an SPD curve from
- the ¹⁴C dates, which is binned into 200-year time windows and is presented in Woodbridge et
 al. (2021).
- 339

340 2.2 Data analysis

341

Disturbance is caused by numerous factors associated with natural and human induced 342 environmental changes. Population change reflects land requirements for agriculture, 343 however, archaeodemographic trends are not likely to be linearly related to disturbance, 344 therefore a pastoral/human activity pollen index is used as an indicator of changing 345 disturbance levels. The index is a sum of untransformed pollen percentage data, which 346 includes Asteraceae subfamily Asteroideae, Asteraceae subfamily Lactucoideae, Cynareae, 347 Rubiaceae, Ranunculaceae, Potentilla, Plantago lanceolata, Plantago major, Plantago 348 media, Chenopodiaceae, Rumex, Urtica and Cerealia. The inclusion of certain taxa within the 349 350 index has been informed by previous work involving pastoral/human activity pollen indices (Behre, 1986; Berglund, 1991, Mazier et al., 2006; 2009; Fyfe et al. 2010; Araujo et al., 351 2020). Pollen indices of human activity should be interpreted with recognition that taxa may 352

- also occur naturally as well as associated with anthropogenic activity.
- 354

The 'Vegan' R package (Oksanen et al., 2019) was used to calculate Shannon diversity 355 (Magurran, 2003) index within the total land pollen assemblage on a 200-year continuous 356 time scale. This index was selected to visualise evenness separately from diversity, as sample 357 evenness is informative about vegetation homogeneity or heterogeneity. The pollen sites were 358 divided into four sub-regions (Fig. 1: grey rings) for exploration of regional diversity trends. 359 The R package 'hillR' (Li, 2018) was used to estimate species richness and diversity (Hill 360 numbers) for the beetle and pollen datasets according to archaeological periods within the 361 insect dataset. A pairwise Wilcox test was used to test the differences between insect and 362 pollen diversity scores by archaeological period after identifying that the data are not 363 normally distributed using a Shapiro test (STHDA, 2022). A diversity index has also been 364 produced using REVEALS transformed pollen data (i.e. data that have been converted to 365 quantified vegetation) (Fig. 3). This allows comparison of diversity based on all land pollen 366 percentage data with diversity from quantified vegetation, which more accurately reflects 367 regional landscape character. 368

369

Rate of Change (RoC) calculations followed the method described by Finsinger et al. (2017)

371 where chord distance is used as a measure for dissimilarity between pollen assemblages to

estimate within-site RoC between consecutive time windows. RoC values were subsequently

- averaged across sites for each 200-year time window. Spearman's Rank correlation was used
- to analyse the relationship between archaeobotanical remains and pollen diversity. An
- analogue-matching approach (Simpson & Oksanen, 2021) has been applied to the pollen
- datasets to identify similar and dissimilar assemblages between all 200-year time windows
- through the Holocene. The closest analogues for each pollen sample from the 297 sequences

have been determined using the 'analog' package with R (Simpson & Oksanen, 2021).

- Analogue groups are defined according to whether the most recent pollen assemblage (200
- cal. BP present) has a close analogue in the last 1000 years, a close analogue older than
- 1000 years, or no close analogue through the entire record. Insect samples assigned 'modern'
- 382 were deemed unsuitable for comparison with insect datasets from earlier archaeological
- 383 periods using the analogue-matching approach, as the collection methods for modern samples
- differ from methods applied to paleoenvironmental insect samples leading to certain taxagroups being over-represented.
- 386387 3. Results
- 388

390

389 3.1 Diversity and disturbance trends across Britain

When amalgamated for all sites across Britain (Fig. 1), diversity scores derived from the 391 insect and pollen datasets reveal similarities from the Mesolithic (7050 BC) (~9000 cal. BP) 392 to the Bronze Age and distinctive patterns in more recent parts of the records (Fig. 2). The 393 394 insect datasets show an increase in diversity from the Mesolithic to the Neolithic and Bronze 395 Age. Pollen data also show an increasing trend in diversity during this time, as human land use was a major factor leading to opening of vegetation cover (Woodbridge et al., 2014a). 396 Insect diversity then declined during the Iron Age, while pollen diversity continued to 397 increase during this period. Insect diversity subsequently increased during the Roman period, 398 while pollen diversity appears to decrease slightly during Roman times. This was followed by 399 a decline in insect diversity during the medieval and modern periods; however, this pattern 400 reflects the different number of samples from this period, and the different sampling approach 401 for modern samples. Pollen diversity remained stable during medieval times and declined 402 slightly in the most recent time period. Statistically significant differences are evident in 403 404 insect and pollen diversity between archaeological periods (Table 2). Greatest differences are observed between the Late Glacial, Mesolithic, Neolithic, and subsequent periods for the 405 insect data, and between all archaeological periods other than the Roman to medieval within 406 the pollen datasets. Reflecting these patterns, highest Rate of Change in the pollen datasets is 407 408 shown in the most recent 1000 years (Fig. 3). Insect diversity is not statistically related to pollen diversity, but insect diversity is significantly related to pollen sample evenness. 409 However, correlations are influenced by the lower insect sample sizes for some periods and 410 the limited comparison possible with the underlying data (eight archaeological periods). 411

412

Decreased insect diversity in the medieval period, which is not reflected by declining pollen 413 diversity, may be captured by declining pollen evenness (Fig. 2) showing that landscapes 414 have become increasingly dominated by certain plant types. These patterns reflect the 415 416 changing scale and spectrum of land-use practice (Figs. 2 and 3) and population trends inferred from archaeological records (Fig. 3). The larger range in the insect diversity box 417 plots (Fig. 2) indicates significant spread within the data, signalling considerable variability 418 between sites. Diversity scores derived from British Isles pollen datasets using different 419 measures of diversity (Hill Numbers, Shannon diversity, evenness and Rarefaction) have 420

421 previously revealed very similar trends (Woodbridge et al., 2021). Comparison of diversity

422 trends after separating lake and peatland site types based on all 153 pollen taxa shows similar

423 patterns with only minor differences, which are most notably in pollen sample evenness in

424 the most recent period (Fig. 3).

425

426



427 428

Figure 2. Insect and pollen diversity change through archaeological periods: a) insect species
richness, b) insect Shannon diversity index, c) pollen Shannon diversity index and d) pollen
Shannon evenness. Box plots show the mean values (black horizontal lines), first and third
quartile (blue bars), and "whiskers" show the data range after filtering outliers (circles).
'Modern' in the pollen datasets represents 200 cal. BP - present. 'Number of samples' refers
to the number of individual samples within the archaeological period.

435

Table 2 Kruskal-Wallis test *p*-values for Shannon diversity change between archaeological
time periods: a) fossil pollen datasets, b) fossil insect datasets, c) Spearman's Rank (*r*-value)
correlations between pollen diversity (Shannon index) and evenness and land use inferred
from archaeobotanical assemblages, and d) Spearman's Rank (*r*-value) correlations between
pollen diversity and evenness and insect diversity (Hill Numbers). Shaded cells indicate

441 statistical significance (p < 0.05).

a) Pollen	Mesolithic	Neolithic	Bronze Age	lron Age	Roman	Medieval
Neolithic	0.00					
Bronze Age	0.00	0.00				
Iron Age	0.00	0.00	0.00			
Roman	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00		
Medieval	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.51	
Modern	0.02	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00

b) Insects	Late glacial	Mesolithic	Neolithic	Bronze Age	lron Age	Roman	Medieval
Mesolithic	0.01						
Neolithic	0.00	0.45					
Bronze Age	0.00	0.00	0.00				
Iron Age	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.02			
Roman	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.32	0.00		
Medieval	0.00	0.04	0.11	0.26	0.95	0.06	
Modern	0.85	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00

c) Land use and pollen diversity	Cereals	Gathered
Pollen: Shannon diversity index	0.806	-0.806
Pollen: Shannon evenness	0.721	-0.648

d) Insect and pollen diversity	Insects H1	Insects H0	Insects H2
Pollen: Shannon diversity index	0.310	0.238	0.333
Pollen: Shannon evenness	0.762	0.738	0.833



- 450 Figure 3. a) land-use change based on crop spectrum and scale of agriculture using a
- 451 conceptual interpretive scale (de Vareilles et al., in review), b) summed probability
- 452 distribution (SPD) of radiocarbon-dated archaeological sites from across Britain
- 453 (archaeodemographic trend), c) Shannon diversity derived from REVEALS transformed
- 454 pollen data (based on 23 taxa), d) Shannon evenness for all land pollen types (153 taxa
- groups) separated according to sample context (peatlands vs. lakes) with standard error, e)
- 456 Shannon diversity index for all land pollen types (153 taxa groups), f) pollen-inferred Rate of
- 457 Change for all British sites (solid red line shows average values and the error bars show the
- 458 standard deviation).
- 459
- 460 The average pollen diversity scores and average pastoral/human activity pollen index,
- 461 reflecting land conversion for agriculture, is presented in Fig. 4 for different regions. The
- dates represent the mid-point of each 200-year time window (e.g. 300 BP on the plot
- 463 represents the period 400-200 BP). The time periods spanning 2000-1000 cal. BP (950 BC -
- 464 AD 50) have highest pastoral/human activity index values and diversity, while earlier
- 465 prehistoric periods are characterised by lower diversity scores, reflecting the low impact on
- 466 vegetation cover that small-scale, and perhaps irregular (Stevens and Fuller, 2012),
- 467 agricultural practices would have had. Pollen diversity declines in the 300 and 100 cal. BP
- 468 (400 cal. BP present) time windows (Fig. 4) in Scotland, southwest England and for all
- 469 British sites while the pastoral/human activity index increases. This pattern is shown for all
- 470 regions other than southeast England and the midlands where 100 cal. BP (200 cal. BP -
- 471 present) represents a period with higher diversity. Land-use scale and spectrum (i.e. range of
- 472 crops) shown on the southeast England plot inferred from archaeobotanical records illustrates
- the increasing intensity of agriculture with highest pollen diversity scores during the Iron Age
- to Roman transition (~2100 cal. BP) (150 BC) and the late Saxon period (~900 cal. BP) (AD
 1050). The impacts of land-use change are illustrated in Fig. 6, which shows that pollen
- 475 1050). The impacts of faile-use change are indistrated in Fig. 0, which shows that potent 476 diversity index scores are statistically significantly related to changing land-use practices
- evidenced in archaeobotanical remains (Table 2c). Pollen diversity is positively related to
- 477 conducted in archaeobotanical remains (Table 2c). Fonce diversity is positively related to478 crop and cereal plant types, particularly during the early Iron Age, Late Bronze Age and
- 479 Roman period, and negatively related to plant types associated with gathering.



482 **Figure 4.** Pastoral/human activity pollen index plotted against Shannon diversity index

483 (pollen derived). Dates in cal. BP (cal. year Before Present) represent the mid-point of a 200-

484 year time window (e.g. 300 represents 400-200 cal. BP). The sub-regional divisions are

shown on Fig. 1. The error bars represent the standard deviation within the datasets for each

time window. Symbols used in plot a) reflect changing land use in terms of crop spectrum

487 and scale for corresponding time periods.

The spatial distribution of pollen sites in the most recent period (200 cal. BP - present) with 489 matching analogues (i.e. similar species assemblages) in the last 1000 years and the rest of 490 the Holocene (11,700 - 1000 cal. BP) is shown in Fig. 5 in relation to modern landscape data. 491 Sites with a close analogue in the last 1000 years (red circles) are located across the British 492 493 Isles, which reflects the higher Rate of Change in the pollen assemblage during this time. This is the main analogue match type in the southeast of England where agricultural 494 suitability is highest and topographic roughness is lowest (Fig. 5b). Sites with a close 495 analogue older than 1000 years (grey circles) are largely located in Scotland where 496 topographic roughness is higher (i.e. relating to the distinction between uplands and 497 lowlands). Sites with no analogue (blue squares) have a more mixed distribution and may 498 represent ecological novelty in the last 200 years. 499

500





502

Figure 5 a) Pollen analogue matching between the most recent time period (200 cal. BP present) and 200-year time windows spanning the Holocene (11700 - 200 cal. BP), b) box
plots illustrating the spread of agricultural suitability, elevation and topographic roughness
(derived from modern landscape data) across the pollen sites assigned to each analogue
matching group, and c) ternary plot illustrating the relationships between pollen assemblage
analogue matches and landscape characteristics.

510



b) Pollen diversity and proportion of gathered plants





Figure 6 Pollen diversity (Shannon) index scores plotted against plant macrofossil data
showing the density of: a) cereals, b) gathered plants (plotted on a logarithmic scale) within
bulk archaeobotanical finds.

515

516517 4. Discussion

518

519 *4.1 Pollen and insect diversity and disturbance from arable land use*

520

521 Similar diversity patterns have been identified between the pollen and insect records for
522 certain time periods. However, spatial bias in site locations reduces the comparability of these

523 datasets. Pollen diversity indices imply that land conversion for agriculture, associated with

524 early land-use and woodland removal, initially led to an increase in the diversity of

525 vegetation across many sites. An increase in insect diversity with forest reduction from the

- 526 Mesolithic to the Bronze Age is to be expected as clearance and disturbance in woodland
- 527 leads to the 'edge effect' that promotes insect diversity (Guimarães et al., 2014). Insects

- 528 associated with agricultural activity and the presence of grazing animals are known to have
- become more abundant during the Bronze Age as a result of land-use changes associated with
- agriculture, particularly the emergence of spatially extensive field systems and the niches that
- 531 emerged around these, which includes, for example, ditches and hedgerows (Smith et al.,
- 5322019). Periods of increasing insect diversity are reflected by the creation of early
- ⁵³³ 'fieldscapes' and anthropogenic heathlands (Løvschal, 2021) with large-scale grazing
- regimes since ~4000 cal. BP (~2050 BC), which were sustained by disturbance, with
- 535 landscape longevity and resilience varying spatially. The increase in insect diversity from the
- 536 Mesolithic to the Neolithic and Bronze Age may reflect opening of woodland and
- 537 diversification of habitats.
- 538

Significant relationships between pollen diversity and palaeodemographic change have been 539 demonstrated with *r*-values between 0.5 and 0.8 since the advent of agriculture (Woodbridge 540 et al., 2021), which indicates that land requirements for human populations are linked to 541 pollen diversity change. Through investigating relationships between human activity, as a 542 proxy for disturbance, and diversity change through time, pollen and insect datasets show 543 higher levels of diversity during periods of increasingly varied land use, i.e. during the 544 Bronze Age and Iron Age, in comparison to more recent periods (Fig. 5), and that land-use 545 phases broadly reflect demographic trends (Fig. 3). Higher pollen diversity has also been 546 associated with numerous grassland and wetland taxa, crops and weeds in central Europe 547 (Roleček et al., 2021). The results presented here (Fig. 4) show highest diversity in the land-548 use phase characterised by 'surplus production with further diversification of crops' from the 549 Late Iron Age into the Roman period and during the late Saxon period. The variation in 550 diversity scores between pollen and insect sites (Fig. 2) may reflect regional variability in 551 land use and demonstrates that the level of disturbance is not the only factor influencing 552 diversity, but the type of disturbance is also relevant, and whether this leads to the creation of 553 554 new habitats or the removal of key habitats.

555

Previous analysis of fossil insect datasets has revealed significant assemblage change in 556 lowland Britain resulting from the creation of middle Bronze Age and Iron Age field systems 557 with stenotopic woodland species replaced by eurytopic open and disturbed ground types 558 along with species that are associated with the dung of domestic grazing animals (Smith et 559 al., 2019; 2020). The decline in insect diversity identified during the Iron Age may reflect a 560 reduced range of habitats with a shift towards taxa typical of open disturbed ground and 561 animal dung. Increased settlement and agricultural waste, and the introduction of new insect 562 species into Britain, such as grain pests, also contributed to assemblage change (Smith et al., 563 2020). The Mesolithic woodland insect faunas include a large number of species represented 564 by low numbers of individuals whereas agricultural faunas are represented by a large number 565 of individuals from a smaller selection of species. The increased scale of cultivation and the 566 development of other land-use activities evident during the Roman period (Table 2) would 567 have led to the creation of new habitats and a higher level of human-induced disturbance. 568 Highest pollen diversity scores are seen in the Iron Age and highest insect diversity values 569 are identified in the Roman period. The slight decrease in pollen diversity scores during the 570 571 late Roman period may represent the first time in British farming history when land-use

- 572 expanded at the expense of vegetation diversity (de Vareilles et al., in review).
- 573 Archaeological evidence for agricultural productivity during the centuries immediately after
- the Roman period is scarce (McKerracher, 2018). A resurgence in agricultural productivity
- 575 into the medieval period is accompanied by higher pollen diversity. This period was followed
- by increasing abundance of strongly synanthropic insect species, such as grain pests, which
- 577 were introduced into Britain during Romans times (Smith et al., 2020). Insect assemblage
- changes identified in earlier studies (Smith et al., 2020) are reflected by significant increases
- 579 in insect diversity compared to Mesolithic (pre-agricultural) levels (Fig. 2).
- 580

Shifts in insect diversity appear more pronounced than shifts in pollen diversity when data are 581 amalgamated at a broad spatial scale. However, differences in how pollen and insect data 582 sense the landscape, how these indicators respond to land use, and the spatial and temporal 583 differences in the distribution of sites, will have affected the patterns observed. The pollen 584 data cover a larger geographical area and include a greater number of sites while the insect 585 data largely cover southern England and the midlands. Regional dissimilarities have been 586 documented previously, for example, pollen evidence suggests that some regions of former 587 Roman Britain (e.g. northern England) experienced an episode of land abandonment 588 (evidenced as woodland regeneration) in the immediate post-Roman period, following an 589 expansion of open land in the late Iron Age/early Roman period (Dark, 2000). Other types of 590 disturbances, such as climatic change or disease (Flynn and Mitchell, 2019; Halsch et al., 591 2021), affect plant and insect diversity in different ways, and may explain the different trends 592 identified in the most recent part of the records. When considering recognised Holocene 593 climatic events (Vinther et al., 2009), there are no clearly identifiable episodes reflected in 594 the pollen and insect diversity trends. However, statistically significant relationships have 595 previously been identified between paleoclimate records reflecting North Atlantic conditions 596 and pollen diversity trends (Woodbridge et al., 2021) demonstrating that diversity patterns are 597 constrained by species climatic optima within the context of changing land use. 598

599

0 *4.2 Identifying patterns of diversity change*

600 601

602 Previous research has shown that Rate of Change (i.e. the degree of difference between adjacent samples over a known period of time) in pollen assemblages increased through the 603 Holocene in other European regions (Finsinger et al., 2017) and on a global scale (Mottl et al. 604 2021b). These broad patterns are reflected within results from analysis of the British pollen 605 datasets in this study, which includes an increase in Rate of Change following the Last 606 Glacial Maximum transition and a more pronounced increase during the late Holocene. Rate 607 of Change analysis allows both periods of perturbation, but also of stability, to be identified. 608 The longest periods of stability (Fig. 3) occurred during the most forested period (~8000 -609 6000 cal. BP) and during periods of lower land-use intensity from ~9000 - 1000 cal. BP 610 (~7050 - 950 AD) (Fig. 3). The insect and pollen datasets show similarities in terms of 611 diversity trends, but the timing of episodes of stability differ. There is a clearer late Holocene 612 decline in diversity in the insect datasets, which may reflect differences in the response to 613 land-use change or disparities associated with sampling locations and the lower number of 614 615 insect sites in this period. Although the pollen datasets do not show a clear decline in

- diversity in the most recent period at a broad scale, altered assemblage composition may be
- 617 captured by the recent decline in pollen sample evenness, indicating the emergence of more
- 618 homogeneous landscapes, however, this decline is of a relatively small scale compared to
- other shifts in the record. There are some differences in the pollen diversity trends in the
- 620 current study and those presented in Woodbridge et al. (2021) due to the addition 100 extra
- sites to the British Isles pollen dataset, and the exclusion of pollen records from
- archaeological sites to capture landscape scale vegetation change. For example, the current
- study shows stronger evidence of a more recent decline in pollen diversity scores.
- 624

The increase in pollen assemblage Rate of Change (Fig. 3) is reflected by increasing pastoral/ 625 human activity pollen index values. Diversity change is not only influenced by the scale of 626 agriculture, but reflects the varied use of land, regional characteristics, and different 627 functional relationships. This is indicated by dissimilarities in the results for each region 628 629 where land-use practices would have varied (Fig. 4). Diversity trends inferred using all terrestrial pollen taxa differ from diversity trends derived from REVEALS quantified 630 vegetation. This index shows a decline in diversity since ~6000 cal. BP (~4050 BC). These 631 datasets capture different aspects of diversity: the former represents palynological diversity 632 (Odgaard, 1999; Woodbridge et al., 2021), and the latter reflects the patterning and structure 633 of landscapes (Matthias et al., 2015). The REVEALS approach incorporates site-type 634 differences into the model when estimating regional land cover (Sugita, 2007). There are 635 more woody than herbaceous taxa with RPPs that are used in the REVEALS approach, which 636 may lead to bias towards woody vegetation in the diversity scores based on REVEALS 637 transformed data, and therefore the pattern (Fig 3c) may reflect loss of woodland, while the 638 'all land pollen taxa' diversity trend represents the number of pollen types with higher 639 diversity of herbaceous species linked to woodland opening. This has led to an inversed 640 relationship between the 'REVEALS transformed vegetation diversity' and 'all land pollen 641 642 diversity' curves. When compared with pollen diversity using all 153 land pollen taxa groups (i.e. the percentage data for all terrestrial pollen types), differences are also evident due to the 643 more limited number of taxa, and the correction for production and dispersal differences 644 between taxa in the regional scale vegetation cover estimates produced by REVEALS. The 645 646 selection of sites that the REVEALS approach was applied to also differs from the sites that were used in the 'all taxa' diversity scores due to the smaller range of site types suited to the 647 REVEALS models available. The difference in pollen sites represented in the two analyses 648 may also explain dissimilates in the index scores. Diversity trends based on all land pollen 649 taxa are therefore deemed more useful for understanding the range of vegetation types in the 650 landscape for comparison with other environmental datasets. 651

652

653 Multiple smaller sites, or combinations of lakes and peat sites can be used to estimate

- regional vegetation cover in the absence of large lakes (Mazier et al., 2012; Fyfe et al., 2013;
- Trondman et al., 2016), but it is unclear what impact this has on diversity measures.
- 656 Separating sites by type (lakes and peatland sites) (Fig. 3) revealed that different site types
- 657 capture pollen diversity change in a similar way, however, a larger decline in evenness within
- datasets from peatland sites in recent centuries is evident. This may reflect the individual
- nature of landscapes from which these datasets are derived. Upland landscapes in particular

have been subject to intense grazing over recent centuries (Yeo and Blackstock, 2002;
Davies, 2016), possibly reducing the diversity of these previously more ecologically complex
landscapes.

663

664 *4.3 The emergence of ecological novelty*

665

Within the pollen datasets analysed in this study, increasing Rate of Change and assemblage 666 novelty is evident and reflects changing land use. Similarly, within analysis of Rate of 667 Change and ecological novelty in pollen datasets from across Europe, Finsinger et al. (2017) 668 identified that land-use change had a greater effect on pollen assemblage Rate of Change and 669 novelty than post-glacial climatic changes. They highlight that novelty did not develop as a 670 constant linear function of time from past baseline conditions and the emergence of novelty 671 accelerated with anthropogenic land-cover changes. The distinctions between the insect 672 datasets in different periods may signify ecological novelty and the emergence of non-673 analogue assemblages through time. Woodland insect faunas were replaced by farmland 674 faunas in the late Bronze Age and early Iron Age, which represented novel assemblages at 675 this time with related shifts in functional diversity signified by changes between stenotypic 676 677 woodland, eurytopic farmland and synanthropic urban taxa. However, species diversity only reflects one aspect of biodiversity. Functional diversity may have remained constant, as 678 different species can have similar functional characteristics: this is described as 'functional 679 redundancy' (Mayfield et al., 2010). Bronze Age insect assemblages are diverse because this 680 phase includes woodland faunas along with wetland faunas and represents the first 681 agricultural field systems. This may signify a transitional period where several ecotypes (i.e. 682 locally adapted populations) co-existed and indicates that times of change are more diverse. 683 The Bronze Age/Iron Age transition is often interpreted to coincide with a change to drier 684 conditions (e.g. van Geel et al., 1996; Molloy, 2022), so climatic changes may have also 685 influenced change in land use. The decline in insect diversity in the Iron Age reflects the 686 agricultural lands from which these faunas have been derived and the lack of representation 687 of multiple habitats. The rise in insect diversity in the Roman period corresponds to an 688 increase in synanthropic diversity in urban areas. However, the lower number of insect sites 689 690 in the medieval period and the different sampling methods used for modern samples influences the trends identified in the data. 691

692

The 'analogue-matching' analysis has revealed a number of pollen sequences where the most 693 recent time window (200 - present) assemblage does not have equivalent analogues either 694 within the same record, or elsewhere within the collection of datasets, and that there are 695 sequences that only have analogues in the past 1000 years. This implies the development of 696 anthropogenic biomes ('anthromes', sensu Ellis, 2015). Considering the characteristics of the 697 pollen samples with close analogues only in the last 1000 years, or those with no analogues, 698 these sites are often located in areas with greater agricultural suitability, implicating 699 intensification of land-use practice in driving ecological novelty. Non-analogue assemblages 700 in the south also include sites in the New Forest, which have been significantly altered by 701 silviculture (Grant & Edwards, 2008). Sites with close analogues older than 1000 years are 702 703 largely located in the north and west of Britain, and in areas of greater topographical

roughness (Fig. 5). The emergence of novelty in the Bronze Age, for example, where the
development of fieldscapes has been shown to increase diversity in both pollen and insect
datasets, is not identified, but these spaces may thus have greater conservation value, through
the persistence of more stable ecological conditions over millennia.

708

709 4.4 Long-term ecology and conservation

710

711 Questions concerning what ecosystem characteristics and taxa to conserve, and where to prioritise conservation efforts, are often not straightforward to answer. Within Dornelas et 712 al.'s (2014) global assessment of biodiversity time series data, assemblages were identified as 713 undergoing biodiversity change, but not systematic biodiversity loss, with threats to key 714 habitats emphasised. Therefore, concern should not only focus on biodiversity loss, but also 715 on changing assemblage composition, which is demonstrated through the analysis of past 716 717 environmental datasets presented in this study. Trends identified correspond with Mayfield et al.'s (2010) findings that species richness and trait diversity change may follow numerous 718 response trajectories after land-use change in different modern landscapes. Land-use changes 719 720 and intensification are often described as major factors in the emergence of ecological 721 novelty (Jackson, 2013; Finsinger et al., 2017; Mottl et al., 2021a), and therefore decisions about future biodiversity conservation will benefit from improved understanding of the past. 722 In applying long-term environmental data to modern environmental questions, there are 723 challenges in analysing data from different environmental archives and proxies. For example, 724 challenges result from differences in chronological control, the spatial coverage of archives, 725 the complexities in amalgamating datasets, obstacles in linking correlation to causation, and 726 the intricacies of the pollen diversity - plant diversity relationship. Greater communication 727 and data integration is required between branches of paleoecology and archaeology, and 728 conservation ecology, to address these challenges and move towards incorporating long-term 729 730 understanding into modern planning.

731

732 **5.** Conclusions

733

734 Through investigating a) 'how disturbance from land-use change affects diversity trends and whether pollen and insect diversity trends show the same patterns of change through time', 735 this study demonstrates that fossil beetle and pollen records show similar diversity trends in 736 the early to middle Holocene with greater dissimilarities in more recent periods. Insect 737 diversity is only statistically correlated with the pollen diversity evenness index indicating a 738 relationship between vegetation heterogeneity and insect diversity, but comparisons are 739 restricted by the number of insect samples for certain time periods and spatial differences in 740 site locations. There are also periods of stability in the pollen diversity data and accelerated 741 change in both the pollen and beetle diversity trends, particularly associated with changing 742 land-use scale and crop spectrum. Comparing land use from archaeobotanical data with 743 pollen data indicates that disturbance affects diversity change with statistically significant 744 relationships demonstrated between the density of cereals and gathered resources and pollen 745 diversity. In addressing b) 'investigating the extent to which ecological novelty can be 746 747 identified in long-term ecological datasets and exploring when novel ecosystems emerge', the

- pollen datasets show ecological novelty in the form of non-analogue assemblages and
- 749 increasing Rate of Change. A high proportion of pollen sites only have a matching analogue
- assemblage in the last 1000 years, modern landscapes with higher agricultural suitability
- appear more likely to have analogues in the last 1000 years, and those with higher
- topographic roughness may be more likely to have analogues older than 1000 cal. BP. This
- indicates that agriculture plays a role in the emergence of novel ecosystems.
- 754

755 The analysis of long-term pollen and insect datasets from across Britain provides evidence of changes in land-cover, disturbance, and diversity through the Holocene and particularly since 756 the onset of farming. Long-term environmental data reveal that change is a normal part of 757 ecosystem functioning. In exploring when and how current patterns of biodiversity emerged 758 and how human actions shaped biodiversity trends, the results of this study indicate that there 759 are no clear baselines for current patterns, which reflect dynamic shifts in land use 760 represented by insect faunal and vegetation responses. Shifts in land use and cultivation 761 broadly follow the same trajectories as those of vegetation and insect diversity. Links 762 between disturbance and diversity have implications for the way in which land-use impacts 763 764 are understood and prioritised for the sustainable use and management of modern landscapes. 765 Increasing Rate of Change and ecologically distinct assemblages are identified in the more recent past within this study. Nature-based solutions for land management that aim to 766 enhance biodiversity will benefit from awareness of the long-term historic relationships 767 between land cover, which is largely the result of human action, and vegetation and insect 768 diversity change. 769

- 770
- 771 Supplementary Information 1 Fossil pollen and insect site metadata for all sites across772 Britain
- 773

774 Acknowledgements

775

The research was funded by the Leverhulme Trust (award number RPG-2018-357) and
supported by the Universities of Plymouth and Birmingham and Historic England. This work

- 778 would not have been possible without open access contributions to the European Pollen
- 779 Database (database manager: Michelle Leydet) and all data contributors (see Supplementary
- 780 Information 1: data contributor names), (BPOL: Michael Grant) archaeobotanical databases
- 781 (ABCD, ADAPT and EUROEVOL), the fossil insect database BugsCEP (Phil Buckland),
- contributions from palynologists, and contributors to open-access repositories of
- archaeological material. We are also grateful to Philipp Sommer for helpful advice regardingthe use of Straditize software.
- 785

786 **References**

- 787
- Allen, M., Lodwick, L., Brindle, T., Fulford, M. & Smith A. (2017) *The Rural Economy of Roman Britain*. London: Britannia Monograph Series 31.
- 790 Behre K-E (1986) Anthropogenic Indicators in Pollen Diagrams. Rotterdam: AA Balkema.

Berglund BE (1991) The Cultural Landscape During 6000 Years in Southern Sweden: The 791 Ystad Project. Ecological Bulletins 41, Oikos. 792 Benedictow, O.L. (2004) The Black Death 1346-1353: The Complete History. Woodbridge: 793 Boydell Press. 794 795 Bevan, A., Crema, E., Bocinsky, R.K., Hinz, M., Riris, P. & Silva, F. (2022) R Package: 796 "rcarbon" - Calibration and Analysis of Radiocarbon Dates. Online: https://github.com/ahb108/rcarbon/. Accessed: Feb 2022. 797 Bibby, J.S., Douglas, H.A., Thomasson, A.J. & Robertson, J.S. (1991) Land capability 798 classification for agriculture. Aberdeen: Macaulay Institute for Soil Research. 799 Bishop, R.R. (2015) Did Late Neolithic farming fail or flourish? A Scottish perspective on 800 the evidence for Late Neolithic arable cultivation in the British Isles, World 801 Archaeology, 47, 834-855. doi: 10.1080/00438243.2015.1072477. 802 Birks, H.J.B., Felde, V.A. & Seddon, A.W. (2016a). Biodiversity trends within the Holocene, 803 The Holocene, 26, 994-1001. doi: 10.1177/0959683615622568. 804 Birks, H.J.B., Felde, V.A., Bjune, A.E., Grytnes, J.A., Seppä, H., & Giesecke, T. (2016b). 805 Does pollen-assemblage richness reflect floristic richness? A review of recent 806 developments and future challenges, Review of Paleobotany and Palynology, 228, 1-807 808 25. doi: 10.1016/j.revpa lbo.2015.12.011. Blaauw, M., Andres Christen, J. & Aquino Lopez, M.A. (2021). rbacon: Age-Depth 809 Modelling using Bayesian Statistics. R package: version 2.5.7. https://CRAN.R-810 project.org/package=rbacon. 811 Blaauw, M. (2010) Methods and code for 'classical' age-modelling of radiocarbon sequences. 812 Quaternary Geochronology, 5, 512-518. doi: 10.1016/j.quageo.2010.01.002. 813 Booth P., Dodd, A., Robinson, M. & Smith, A. (2007) The Thames Through Time. The 814 Archaeology of the Gravel Terraces of the Upper and Middle Thames. The Early 815 Historic Period: AD 1-1000. Thames Through Time 3, Oxford: Oxford Archaeology. 816 Bradley, R. (2007) The Prehistory of Britain and Ireland. Cambridge World Series. 817 Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 818 Brown, A. (2007) Dating the onset of cereal cultivation in Britain and Ireland: the evidence 819 from charred cereal grains. Antiquity, 81/314, 104201052. doy: 820 821 10.1017/S0003598X00096101. Bevan, A., Colledge, S., Fuller, D., Fyfe, R., Shennan, S. & Stevens, C. (2017) Holocene 822 fluctuations in human population demonstrate repeated links to food production and 823 climate. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 114, E10524-E10531. doi: 824 10.1073/pnas.17091 90114 825 Buckland, P.I. & Buckland, P.C. (2006). BugsCEP Coleopteran Ecology Package. IGBP 826 PAGES/World Data Center for Paleoclimatology Data Contribution Series # 2006-827 116. NOAA/NCDC Paleoclimatology Program, Boulder CO, USA. Online: 828 829 http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/insect.html or http://www.bugscep.com. Accessed: 1/2/2021. 830 Burke, K.D., Williams, J.W., Brewer S., Finsinger, W., Giesecke, T., Lorenz, D.J. & 831 Ordonez, A. (2019) Differing climatic mechanisms control transient and accumulated 832 vegetation novelty in Europe and eastern North America. Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B, 374, 833 20190218. doi: 10.1098/rstb.2019.0218. 834

Carruthers, W. & Hunter Dowse, K. (2019) A review of macroscopic plant remains from the 835 Midland counties. Historic England Research Report Series, 47. 836 Colombaroli, D., Beckmann, M., Van der Knaap, W., Curdy, P. & Tinner, W. (2013) 837 Changes in biodiversity and vegetation composition in the central Swiss Alps during 838 839 the transition from pristine forest to first farming, Diversity and Distributions, 19, 840 157-170. doi: 10.1111/j.1472-4642.2012.00930.x Dark, P. (2000). The Environment of Britain in the First Millennium AD. London: 841 Duckworth. 842 Davies, A.L. (2016). Late Holocene regime shifts in moorland ecosystems: High resolution 843 data from the Pennines, UK, Vegetation History and Archaeobotany, 25, 207-219. 844 Daley, T.J., Thomas, E.R., Holmes, J.A., Street-Perrott, F.A., Chapman, M.R., Tindall, J.C., 845 Valdes, P.J., Loader, N.J., Marshall, J.D., Wolff, E.W., Hopley, P.J., Atkinson, T., 846 Barber, K.E., Fisher, E.H., Robertson, I., Hughes, P.D.M., & Roberts, C.N. (2011) 847 The 8200 yr BP cold event in stable isotope records from the North Atlantic region, 848 Global and Planetary Change, 79, 288-302. doi: 10.1016/j.gloplacha.2011.03.006. 849 de Vareilles, A., Pelling, R., Fyfe, R. & Woodbridge, J. (in review: Holocene) Land-use and 850 851 landscape change in Southeast England. 852 de Vareilles, A. Pelling, R. Woodbridge, J. & Fyfe, R. (2021) Archaeology and agriculture: plants, people and land-use, Trends in Ecology and Evolution. 36, 943-954, doi: 853 10.1016/j.tree.2021.06.003. 854 Deza-Araujo, M., Morales-Molino, C., Tinner, W., Henne, P.D., Heitz, C., Pezzatti, G.B., 855 Hafner, A., Conedera, M. (2020) A critical assessment of human-impact indices based 856 on anthropogenic pollen indicators, Quaternary Science Reviews, 236, 106291. doi: 857 10.1016/j.quascirev.2020.106291. 858 Dornelas, M., Gotelli, N.J., McGill, B., Shimadzu, H., Moyes, F., Sievers, C. & Magurran, A. 859 E. (2014) Assemblage time series reveal biodiversity change but not systematic loss, 860 Science, 344, 296-299. 861 Dudley, N. & Alexander, S. (2017) Agriculture and biodiversity: a review, Biodiversity, 18, 862 45-49, doi: 10.1080/14888386.2017.1351892. 863 Ellis, E.C. (2015) Ecology in an anthropogenic biosphere. Ecological Monographs, 85, 287-864 331. doi: 10.1890/14-2274.1. 865 European Commission (2021) EU Biodiversity Strategy for 2030. First Edition. Luxembourg: 866 Publications Office of the European Union. Online: 867 https://op.europa.eu/en/publication-detail/-/publication/31e4609f-b91e-11eb-8aca-868 01aa75ed71a1. Accessed: 26/11/21. 869 Felde, V.A., Peglar, S.M., Bjune, A.E., Grytnes, J.A., & Birks, H.J.B. (2016). Modern 870 pollen-plant richness and diversity relationships exist along a vegetational gradient in 871 southern Norway. Holocene, 26, 163-175. doi: 10.1177/09596 83615 596843. 872 873 Finsinger, W., Giesecke, T., Brewer, S. & Leydet, M. (2017) Emergence patterns of novelty in European vegetation assemblages over the past 15 000 years. Ecology Letters, 20, 874 336-346. doi: 10.1111/ele.12731. 875 Flynn, L.E. & Mitchell, F.J.G. (2019) Comparison of a recent elm decline with the mid-876 Holocene Elm Decline. Veget. Hist. Archaeobot., 28, 391-398. doi: 10.1007/s00334-877 878 018-0698-3.

879	Forbes, C.J., Gillson, L., Hoffman, M.T. (2018) Shifting baselines in a changing world:
880	Identifying management targets in endangered heathlands of the Cape Floristic
881	Region, South Africa, Anthropocene, 22, 81-93, doi: 10.1016/j.ancene.2018.05.001.
882	Fyfe, R.M., Woodbridge, J. & Roberts, N. (2015) From forest to farmland: pollen-inferred
883	land cover change across Europe using the pseudobiomisation approach, Global
884	Change Biology, 21, 1197-212.
885	Fyfe, R.M., Twiddle, C., Sugita, S., Gaillard, MJ., Barratt, P., Caseldine, C.J., Dodson, J.,
886	Edwards, K., Farrell, M., Froyd, C., Grant, M.J., Huckerby, E., Innes, J.B., Shaw, H.,
887	& Waller, M. (2013) The Holocene vegetation cover of Britain and Ireland:
888	Overcoming problems of scale and discerning patterns of openness. Quaternary
889	Science Reviews, 73, 132-148. doi: 10.1016/j.quasc irev.2013.05.014.
890	Gaston, K.J. (2000). Global patterns in biodiversity. Nature, 405, 220-227. doi:
891	10.1038/35012228
892	Grant, M., & Waller, M. (2017). Resolving complexities of pollen data to improve
893	interpretation of past human activity and natural processes. In: Williams, M., Hill, T.,
894	Boomer, I. & Wilkinson, I. (Eds.), The archaeological and forensic applications of
895	microfossils: a deeper understanding of human history, 103-119. The Geological
896	Society.
897	Grant, M.J. & Edwards, M.E. (2008). Conserving idealized landscapes: past history, public
898	perception and future management in the New Forest (UK). Veget. Hist. Archaeobot.,
899	17, 551-562. doi: 10.1007/s00334-007-0100-3.
900	Guimarães, C.D., De Carvalho, V., João Paulo, R., & Cornelissen, T. (2014) A meta-analysis
901	of the effects of fragmentation on herbivorous insects. Environmental entomology, 43,
902	537-545.
903	Giesecke, T., Wolters, S., van Leeuwen, J.F.N., van der Knaap, P.W.O., Leydet, M. &
904	Brewer, S. (2019) Postglacial change of the floristic diversity gradient in Europe. Nat
905	Commun., 5422. doi: 10.1038/s41467-019-13233-y.
906	Giesecke, T., Ammann, B. & Brande, A. (2014) Palynological richness and evenness:
907	insights from the taxa accumulation curve. Veget. Hist. Archaeobot., 23, 217-228.
908	Githumbi, E., Pirzamanbein, B., Lindström, J., Poska, A., Fyfe, R., Mazier, F., Nielsen, A.B,
909	Sugita, S., Trondman, AK., Woodbridge, J. & Gaillard, M.J. (2022) Pollen-based
910	maps of past regional vegetation cover in Europe over 12 millennia - evaluation and
911	potential, Frontiers in Ecology and Evolution, 10, doi: 10.3389/fevo.2022.795794.
912	Goring, S., Lacourse, T., Pellatt, M.G. & Mathewes, R.W. (2013) Pollen assemblage richness
913	does not reflect regional plant species richness: a cautionary tale. J. Ecol., 101, 1137-
914	1145.
915	Gosling, W.D., Mayle, F.E., Tate, N.J. & Killeen, T.J. (2009) Differentiation between
916	Neotropical rainforest, dry forest, and savannah ecosystems by their modern pollen
917	spectra and implications for the fossil pollen record, Review of Paleobotany and
918	Palynology, 153, 70-85. doi: 10.1016/j.revpalbo.2008.06.007.
919	Halsch, C.A., Shapiro, A.M., Fordyce, J.A., Nice, C.C., Thorne, J.H., Waetjen, D.P. &
920	Forister, M.L. (2021) Insects and recent climate change, Proceedings of the National
921	Academy of Sciences, 118, e2002543117, doi: 10.1073/pnas.2002543117.

Hamerow, H., Bogaard, A., Charles, M., Forster, E., Holmes, M., McKerracher, M. & 922 Thomas, R. (2020) An integrated bioarchaeological approach to the Medieval 923 'agricultural revolution': a case study from Stafford, England, c. AD 800-1200, 924 European Journal of Archaeology, 23, 585-609. doi: 10.1017/eaa.2020.6. 925 926 Historic England (2022) FISH: Forum on Information Standards in Heritage. (online: 927 http://www.heritage-standards.org.uk/chronology/). Accessed: Apr. 2022. Historic England (2018) Field Systems: Introductions to Heritage Assets. Swindon: Historic 928 929 England. Hjelle, K.L., Kaland, S., Kvamme, M., Lødøen, T.K. & Natlandsmyr, B. (2012) Ecology and 930 long-term land-use, Paleoecology and archaeology - the usefulness of 931 interdisciplinary studies for knowledge-based conservation and management of 932 cultural landscapes, Int. J. Biodivers. Sci. Ecosyst. Serv. Manag., 8, 321-337. doi: 933 10.1080/21513732.2012.739576. 934 Jackson, S.T. (2013) Perspective: ecological novelty is not new. In: Novel Ecosystems (eds.) 935 Hobbs, R.J., Higgs, E.S. & Hall, C.M. doi: 10.1002/9781118354186.ch7. 936 Kenward, H.K. (1997) Synanthropic insects and the size, remoteness and longevity of 937 938 archaeological occupation sites: applying concepts from biogeography to past 939 'islands' of human occupation, Quaternary Proceedings, 5, 1350152. Kuneš, P., Abraham, V. & Herben, T. (2019) Changing disturbance-diversity relationships in 940 temperate ecosystems over the past 12000 years, Journal of Ecology, 107, 1678-1688. 941 doi: 10.1111/1365-2745.13136. 942 Leydet, M. (2007–2023). The European Pollen Database. Online: http://www.europ eanpo 943 llend ataba se.net/. Accessed: 1/5/2022. 944 Li, D. (2018) hillR: taxonomic, functional, and phylogenetic diversity and similarity through 945 Hill Numbers, Journal of Open Source Software, 3, 1041, doi: 10.21105/joss.01041. 946 Lodwick, L.A. (2017). Agricultural innovations at a Late Iron Age oppidum: 947 948 Archaeobotanical evidence for flax, food and fodder from Calleva Atrebatum, UK, Quaternary International, 460, 198-219. doi: 10.1016/j.quaint.2016.02.058. 949 Lodwick, L. (2013). Condiments before Claudius: New Plant Foods at the Late Iron Age 950 951 oppidum at Silchester, UK, Vegetation History and Archaeobotany, 23, 543-549, doi: 952 10.1007/s00334-013-0407-1. Lodwick, L., Campbell, G., Crosby, V. & Müldner, G. (2021) Isotopic evidence for changes 953 in cereal production strategies in Iron Age and Roman Britain, Environmental 954 Archaeology: the Journal of Human Paleoecology, 26, 13-28. 955 Løvschal, M. (2021). Anthropogenic heathlands: Disturbance ecologies and the social 956 organisation of past super-resilient landscapes, Antiquity, 95, E14. 957 doi:10.15184/aqy.2021.46. 958 Macualay Land Use Research Institute (1991) The James Hutton Institute Online: 959 960 https://macaulay.webarchive.hutton.ac.uk/ Accessed: 01/10/2020. Magurran, A. E. (2003) Measuring biological diversity. London: Wiley-Blackwell. 961 Marshall, P., Bronk Ramsey, C., Dnbar, E. & Reimer, P. (2019) Chronology and the 962 radiocarbon dating programme, In: A Prehistoric Burial Mound and Anglo-Saxon 963 Cemetery at Barrow Clump, Salisbury Plain, Wiltshire, English Heritage and 964 Operation Nightingale excavations 2003-14 (Andrews, P., Last, J., Osgood, R. & 965

966	Stoodley, N. (eds). Wessex Archaeology Monograph, 40. Salisbury: Wessex
967	Archaeology, 53-62.
968	Martin, J., Schuster, J. and Barclay, A. (2012) Evidence of an Early Bronze Age field system
969	and spelt wheat growing, together with an Anglo-Saxon sunken featured building, at
970	Monkton Road, Minster in Thanet, Archaeologia Cantiana, 132, 43-52.
971	Matthias, I., Semmler, M.S.S. & Giesecke, T. (2015). Palynological diversity captures
972	landscape structure and diversity, Journal of Ecology, 103, 880-890. doi:
973	10.1111/1365-2745.12404.
974	Marquer, L., Gaillard, M.J., Sugita, S. et al. (2014) Holocene changes in vegetation
975	composition in northern Europe: why quantitative pollen-based vegetation
976	reconstructions matter, Quaternary Science Reviews, 90, 199-216. doi:
977	10.1016/j.quascirev.2014.02.013.
978	Mayfield, R.J., Langdon, P.G., Doncaster, C.P., Dearing, J.A., Wang, R., Velle, G., Davies,
979	K.L. & Brooks, S.J (2021) Late Quaternary chironomid community structure shaped
980	by rate and magnitude of climate change, J Quat Sci, 36, 360-376. Doi:
981	10.1002/jqs.3301.
982	Mayfield, M.M., Bonser, S.P., Morgan, J.W., Aubin, I., McNamara, S. & Vesk, P.A. (2010)
983	What does species richness tell us about functional trait diversity? Predictions and
984	evidence for responses of species and functional trait diversity to land-use change.
985	Global Ecology and Biogeography, 19, 423-431. doi: 10.1111/j.1466-
986	8238.2010.00532.x
987	Mazier, F., Gaillard, M.J., Kuneš, P., Sugita, S., Trondman, A-K. & Broström, A. (2012)
988	Testing the effects of site selection and parameter setting on REVEALS-model
989	estimates of plant abundance using the Czech Quaternary Palynological Database,
990	Review of Paleobotany and Palynology, 187, 38-49.
991	Mazier, F., Galop, D., Gaillard, M.J., et al. (2009) Multidisciplinary approach to
992	reconstructing local pastoral activities: an example from the Pyrenean Mountains
993	(Pays Basque), The Holocene, 19, 171-188. doi: 10.1177/0959683608098956.
994	Mazier, F., Galop, D., Brun, C. & Buttler, A. (2006) Modern pollen assemblages from grazed
995	vegetation in the western Pyrenees, France: a numerical tool for more precise
996	reconstruction of past cultural landscapes, The Holocene, 16, 91-103. doi:
997	10.1191/0959683606hl908rp.
998	McKerracher, M. (2018) Farming transformed in Anglo-Saxon England, Oxford: Oxbow
999	Books.
1000	Meltsov, V., Poska, A., vad Odgaard, B., Sammul, M. & Kull, T. (2011) Palynological
1001	richness and pollen sample evenness in relation to local floristic diversity in southern
1002	Estonia, <i>Review of Paleobotany and Palynology</i> , 166, 344-351. doi:
1003	10.1016/j.revpalbo.2011.06.008.
1004	Molloy, B. (2022) Was there a 3.2 ka crisis in Europe? a critical comparison of climatic,
1005	environmental, and archaeological evidence for radical change during the Bronze
1006	Age-Iron Age Transition, J. Archaeol Res, doi: 10.1007/s10814-022-09176-6.
1007	Moossen, H., Bendle, J., Seki, O., Quillmann, U., & Kawamura, K. (2015). North Atlantic
1008	Holocene climate evolution recorded by high-resolution terrestrial and marine

1009 biomarker records, *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 129, 111-127. Online: https://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/study/ 20023. Accessed: 1/5/2021. 1010 Mottl, O., Grytnes, J.A., Seddon, A.W.R., Steinbauer, M.J., Bhatta, K.P., Felde, V.A., 1011 Flantua, S.G.A. & Birks, H.J.B. (2021a) Rate-of-change analysis in paleoecology 1012 1013 revisited: A new approach, Review of Paleobotany and Palynology, 293, 34-6667, 1014 doi: 10.1016/j.revpalbo.2021.104483. Mottl, O., Flantua, S.G.A., Bhatta, K.P., Felde, V.A., Giesecke, T., Goring, S., Grimm, E.C., 1015 Haberle, S., Hooghiemstra, H., Ivory, S., Kuneš, P., Wolters, S., Seddon, A.W.R. & 1016 Williams, J.W. (2021b) Global acceleration in rates of vegetation change over the past 1017 18,000 years, Science, 372, 860-864, doi: 10.1126/science.abg1685 1018 Nature (2020) New Biodiversity Targets Cannot Afford to Fail, Nature, 578, 337-338. 1019 Odgaard, B.V. (1994) The Holocene vegetation history of northern West Jutland, Denmark, 1020 Nordic Journal of Botany, 14, 546-546. doi: 10.1111/j.1756-1051.1994.tb00649.x 1021 1022 Odgaard, B.V. (1999) Fossil pollen as a record of past biodiversity, Journal of Biogeography, 1023 26, 7-17. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2699.1999.00280.x Oksanen, J., Blanchet, F. G., Friendly, M., Kindt, R., Legendre, P., McGlinn, D., Minchin, P. 1024 1025 R., O'Hara, R. B., Simpson, G. L., Solymos, P., Stevens, M. H. H., Szoecs, E. & 1026 Wagner, H. (2019) Vegan: Community ecology package. R package version 2.5-4. Online: https://CRAN.Rproject.org/package=vegan. Accessed: 1/5/2021 1027 Outhwaite, C.L., McCann, P. & Newbold, T. (2022) Agriculture and climate change are 1028 reshaping insect biodiversity worldwide. Nature. 605, 97-102. doi: 10.1038/s41586-1029 022-04644-x. 1030 Pardoe, H.S. (2021) Identifying floristic diversity from the pollen record in open 1031 environments; considerations and limitations, Paleogeography, Paleoclimatology, 1032 Paleoecology, 578, 110560. doi: 10.1016/j.Paleo.2021.110560. 1033 Pilotto, F., Rojas, A. & Buckland, P. (2022) Late Holocene anthropogenic landscape change 1034 1035 in northwestern Europe impacted insect biodiversity as much as climate change did 1036 after the last Ice Age, Proceedings of the Royal Society B. 289, 20212734. doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2021.2734. 1037 Racimo, F., Woodbridge, J., Fyfe, R.M., Sikora, M., Sjögren, K.G., Kristiansen, K. & Vander 1038 1039 Linden, M. (2020) The spatiotemporal spread of human migrations during the European Holocene. PNAS. 117, 8989-9000. 1040 Reimer, P.J., Bard, E., Bayliss, A., Beck, J.W., Blackwell, P.G., Bronk Ramsey, C., Buck, 1041 C.E., Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L., Friedrich, M., Grootes, P.M., Guilderson, T.P., 1042 Haflidason, H., Hajdas, I., Hatté, C., Heaton, T.J., Hogg, A.G., Hughen, K.A., Kaiser, 1043 K.F., Kromer, B., Manning, S.W., Niu, M., Reimer, R.W., Richards, D.A., Scott, 1044 E.M., Southon, J.R., Turney, C.S.M., van der Plicht. J. (2016) IntCal13 and 1045 MARINE13 radiocarbon age calibration curves 0-50000 years cal BP, Radiocarbon, 1046 1047 55. doi: 10.2458/azu js rc.55.16947. Reitalu, T., Bjune, A.E., Blaus, A., Giesecke, T., Helm, A., Matthias, I., Peglar, S.M., 1048 Salonen, J.S., Seppä, H., Väli, V. & Birks, H.J.B. (2019). Patterns of modern pollen 1049 and plant richness across northern Europe, Journal of Ecology, 107, 1662-1677. do: 1050 1051 10.1111/1365-2745.13134.

- Reitalu, T., Gerhold, P., Poska, A., Pärtel, M., Väli, V. & Veski, S. (2015). Novel insights 1052 into post-glacial vegetation change: Functional and phylogenetic diversity in pollen 1053 records, Journal of Vegetation Science, 26, 911-922. doi: 10.1111/jvs.12300. 1054 Roberts, N., Fyfe, R.M., Woodbridge, J., Gaillard, M.J., Davis, B.A.S., Kaplan, J.O., 1055 1056 Marquer, L., Mazier, F., Nielsen, A.B., Sugita, S., Trondman, A.K. & Leydet, M. 1057 (2018) Europe's lost forests: a pollen-based synthesis for the last 11,000 years, Scientific Reports, 716. 1058 1059 Roleček, J., Abraham, V., Vild, O., Svobodová Svitavská, H., Jamrichová, E., Plesková, Z., Pokorný, P. & Kuneš, P. (2021) Holocene plant diversity dynamics show a distinct 1060 biogeographical pattern in temperate Europe, J Biogeogr, 48, 1366-1376. doi: 1061 10.1111/jbi.14082. 1062 Schafstall, N., Kuosmanen, N., Kuneš, P., Svitavská Svobodová, H., Svitok, M., Chiverrell, 1063 R.C., Halsall, K., Fleischer, P., Knížek, M. & Clear, J.L. (2022) Sub-fossil bark 1064 beetles as indicators of past disturbance events in temperate Picea abies mountain 1065 forests, Quaternary Science Reviews, 275, 107289. doi: 1066 10.1016/j.quascirev.2021.107289. 1067 1068 Serjeantson, D. (2012) Review of Animal Remains from the Neolithic and Early Bronze Age of Southern Britain (4000 BC - 1500 BC), Historic England Research Department 1069 1070 *Reports* 29/2011. Shennan, S., Downey, S., Timpson, A. et al. (2013) Regional population collapse followed 1071 initial agriculture booms in mid-Holocene Europe, Nat Commun, 4, 2486. doi: 1072 10.1038/ncomms3486. 1073 1074 Simpson, G.L. & Oksanen, J. (2021). analogue: Analogue matching and Modern Analogue Technique transfer function models, R package version 0.17-6. Online: https://cran.r-1075 project.org/package=analogue). 1076 1077 Smith, D. N. (2012). Insects in the city: an archaeoentomological perspective on London's 1078 past, British Archaeological Reports, British Series 561. Archaeopress. 1079 Smith, D. S., Hill, G., Kenward, H., & Allison, E. (2020). Development of synanthropic beetle faunas over the last 9000 years in the British Isles, Journal of Archaeological 1080 Science, 115, 105075. doi: 10.1016/j.jas.2020.105075. 1081 1082 Smith, D., Hill, G., & Kenward, H. (2019). The development of late-Holocene farmed 1083 landscapes: analysis of insect assemblages using a multi-period dataset, The Holocene, 29, 45-63. doi: 10.1177/0959683618804645. 1084 Smith, D., Whitehouse, N., Bunting, M. J., & Chapman, H. (2010). Can we characterise 1085 'openness' in the Holocene Paleoenvironmental record? Modern analogue studies of 1086 insect faunas and pollen spectra from Dunham Massey deer park and Epping Forest, 1087 England, The Holocene, 20, 215-229. doi: 10.1177/0959683609350392. 1088 Smith MR (2017) Ternary: An R Package for Creating Ternary Plots, Comprehensive R 1089 Archive Network. 1090 1091 Sommer, P., Rech, D., Chevalier, M. & Davis, B.A.S. (2019) Straditize: Digitizing Stratigraphic Diagrams, Journal of Open Source Software, 4, 1216, doi: 1092 10.21105/joss.01216. 1093 Steinhilber, F., Abreu, J. A., Beer, J., Brunner, I., Christl, M., Fischer, H., Heikkilä, U., 1094
- 1095 Kubik, P. W., Mann, M., McCracken, K. G., Miller, H., Miyahara, H., Oerter, H., &

1096	Wilhelms, F. (2012). 9,400 years of cosmic radiation and solar activity from ice cores
1097	and tree rings. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 109, 5967-5971.
1098	https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.11189 65109
1099	Stevens, C.J. and Fuller, D.Q. (2018) The Fighting Flora: an examination of the origins and
1100	changing composition of the weed flora of the British Isles. 23-36. In: Lightfoot, E. et
1101	al. (eds) Far from the Hearth: Essays in Honour of Martin K. Jones. Cambridge:
1102	McDonald Institute for Archaeological Research Monograph.
1103	Stevens, C.J. & Fuller, D.Q. (2015) Alternative strategies to agriculture: the evidence for
1104	climatic shocks and cereal declines during the British Neolithic and Bronze Age (a
1105	reply to Bishop), World Archaeology, 47/5, 856-875. doi:
1106	10.1080/00438243.2015.1087330.
1107	Stevens, C. & Fuller, D. (2012). Did Neolithic farming fail? The case for a Bronze Age
1108	agricultural revolution in the British Isles, Antiquity, 86, 707-722. doi:
1109	<u>10.1017/S0003598X00047864</u> .
1110	Sugita, S. (2007). Theory of quantitative reconstruction of vegetation I: Pollen from large
1111	lakes REVEALS regional vegetation composition, The Holocene, 17, 229-241. doi:
1112	10.1177/0959683607075837.
1113	Treasure, E.R. & Church, M.J. (2017) Can't find a pulse? Celtic bean (Vicia faba L.) in
1114	British prehistory, Environmental Archaeology, 22/2, 113-127. doi:
1115	10.1080/14614103.2016.1153769.
1116	Trondman, A-K., Gaillard, M.J., Sugita, S., Björkman, L., Greisman, A., Hultberg, T.,
1117	Lagerås, P., Lindbladh, M. & Mazier, F. (2016) Are pollen records from small sites
1118	appropriate for REVEALS model-based quantitative reconstructions of past regional
1119	vegetation? An empirical test in southern Sweden, Vegetation History and
1120	Archaeobotany, 25, 131-151.
1121	Trondman, A-K., Gaillard, M. J., Sugita, S., Fyfe, R., Nielsen, A. B., Twiddle, C., Barratt, P.,
1122	Birks, H. J. B., Bjune, A. E., Björkman, L., Broström, A., Caseldine, C., David, R.,
1123	Dodson, J., Dörfler, W., Fischer, E., van Geel, B., Giesecke, T., Hultberg, T. & Wick,
1124	L. (2015). Pollen-based land-cover reconstructions for the study of past vegetation-
1125	climate interactions in NW Europe at 0.2 k, 0.5 k, 3 k and 6 k years before present,
1126	Global Change Biology, 21, 676-697. doi: 10.1111/gcb.12737.
1127	van Geel, B., Buurman, J. and Waterbolk, H.T. (1996) Archaeological and palaeoecological
1128	indications of an abrupt climate change in The Netherlands, and evidence for
1129	climatological teleconnections around 2650 BP. J. Quaternary Sci., 11, 451-460. doi:
1130	10.1002/(SICI)1099-1417(199611/12)11:6<451::AID-JQS275>3.0.CO;2-9
1131	van der Knaap, W.O. (2009) Estimating pollen diversity from pollen accumulation rates: a
1132	method to assess taxonomic richness in the landscape, The Holocene, 19, 159-163.
1133	doi: 10.1177/0959683608098962.
1134	van der Veen, M. (2014) Arable Farming, Horticulture, and Food: Expansion, Innovation,
1135	and Diversity in Roman Britain. In: Millet, M. et al. (eds) The Oxford Handbook of
1136	Roman Britain, Oxford: Oxford University Press. doi:
1137	10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199697713.013.046.
1138	van der Veen, M. (1992) Crop Husbandry Regimes. An Archaeobotanical Study of Farming
1139	in Northern England: 1000 BC - AD 500. Sheffield: JR Collis Publications.

- van der Veen, M., Livarda, A. & Hill, A. (2007). The archaeobotany of Roman Britain –
 current state and identification of research priorities, *Britannia*, 38, 181-210. doi:
 10.3815/00000007784016557.
- Vinther, B.M., Buchardt, S.L., Clausen, H.B., Dahl-Jensen, D., Johnsen, S.J., Fisher, D.A.,
 Koerner, R.M., Raynaud, D., Lipenkov, V., Andersen, K.K., Blunier, T., Rasmussen,
 S.O., Steffensen, J.P. & Svensson, A.M. (2009). Holocene thinning of the Greenland
 ice sheet, *Nature*, 461, 385-388. doi: 10.1038/natur e08355.
- Weng, C., Hooghiemstra, H. & Duivenvoorden, J.F. (2007) Response of pollen diversity to
 the climate-driven altitudinal shift of vegetation in the Colombian Andes. Phil. Trans.
 R. Soc. B362253–262. http://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2006.1985.
- Weng, C., Hooghiemstra, H. & Duivenvoorden, J.F. (2006) Challenges in estimating past
 plant diversity from fossil pollen data: statistical assessment, problems, and possible
 solutions, *Diversity and Distributions*, 12, 310-318. doi: 10.1111/j.13669516.2006.00230.x
- Whittle, A., Healy, F. & Bayliss, A. (2011) *Gathering Time: Dating the Early Neolithic Enclosures of Southern Britain and Ireland*. Oxford: Oxbow Books.
- Willis, K.J., Bailey, R.M., Bhagwat, S.A. & Birks, H.J.B. (2010) Biodiversity baselines,
 thresholds and resilience: testing predictions and assumptions using paleoecological
 data, *Trends in Ecology & Evolution*, 25, 583-591, doi: 10.1016/j.tree.2010.07.006.
- Wilson, O. (2021): Putting nature centre stage? The challenges of 'mainstreaming'
 biodiversity in the planning process, *Journal of Environmental Planning and Management*, doi: 10.1080/09640568.2021.1999219.
- Witcher, R. (2013). On Rome's ecological contribution to British flora and fauna: landscape,
 legacy and identity, *Landscape History*, 34, 5-26, doi:
 10.1080/01433768.2013.855393.
- Woodbridge, J., Fyfe, R. M., Roberts, N., Downey, S., Edinborough, K., & Shennan, S.
 (2014a). The impact of the Neolithic agricultural transition in Britain: A comparison of pollen-based land-cover and archaeological ¹⁴C date-inferred population change.
 Journal of Archaeological Science, 51, 216-224.
- Woodbridge, J., Fyfe, R. M. & Roberts, N. (2014b) A comparison of remote-sensed and
 pollen-based approaches to mapping Europe's land cover. *Journal of Biogeography*.
 41, 2080-2092.
- Woodbridge, J. Fyfe, R. Smith, D. Pelling, R. de Vareilles, A. Batchelor, R. Bevan, A. &
 Davies, A. (2021) What drives biodiversity patterns? Using long-term
 multidisciplinary data to discern centennial scale change, *Journal of Ecology*, 109, 1396-1410.
- Woodbridge, J., Roberts, C.N. & Fyfe, R.M. (2019) Vegetation and land-use change in
 northern Europe during Late Antiquity: a regional-scale pollen-based reconstruction, *Environment and society during the long Late Antiquity: Late Antique Archaeology*Journal, 11, 105-118.
- Yeo, M.J.M. & Blackstock, T.H. (2002). A vegetation analysis of the pastoral landscapes of
 upland Wales, UK, *Journal of Vegetation Science*, 13, 803-816.
- 1182
- 1183 Author contributions

- 1184
- JW, RF, RP, DS and AdV were central to the conception and design, acquisition of data,
 analysis and interpretation of the data. JW drafted the manuscript and RF, RP, DS and AdV
- analysis and interpretation of the data. JW drafted the manuscript and RF, RP, DS and AdV
- 1187 revised the content critically contributing intellectual content. MG, RB, RS, JG, PD, DD, GG,
- 1188 AP, TH, ES, MS, FC, CB and MW contributed pollen data for analysis and commented on
- the manuscript providing critical feedback. All authors gave final approval of the version tobe published.
- 1191

1192 Data availability statement

- 1193
- 1194 The results of the analyses carried out are archived within the open access PANGAEA
- database. Many of the original pollen datasets used in this study are available from the
- 1196 European Pollen Database (EPD; www.europeanpollendatabase.net/) and can be accessed
- 1197 here: http://www.europeanpollendatabase.net/fpd-epd/bibli.do (please see Supplementary
- 1198 Information for site names, author names and references). The EPD is also available as an
- 1199 Access database, which can be downloaded
- 1200 here: http://www.europeanpollendatabase.net/data/downl oads/ and the same datasets are
- 1201 available via the Neotoma Database: https://www.neotomadb.org/. The majority of the fossil
- 1202 insect datasets are available from BugsCEP (http://bugscep.com/). The latest version of the
- BugsCEP Access database can be downloaded here: http://bugsc ep.com/downl oads.html.
- 1204 All radiocarbon dates used for Paleodemographic reconstructions are available within
- 1205 University College London's Discovery database (discovery.ucl.ac.uk/10025178/:
- 1206 https://doi.org/10.14324/ 000.ds.10025178). For a full set of sources and acknowledgements
- 1207 for the radiocarbon data see Bevan et al. (2017). Archaeobotanical datasets are stored within
- 1208 ArboDat (https://nihk.de/en/research/current-projects/arbodat-ape) and are available via the
- $1209 \qquad ABCD \ (https://www.intarch.ac.uk/journal/issue1/tomlinson/toc.html).$